



DROI_PV(2020)0217_1

MINUTES

**Meeting of 17 February 2020, 15.00-18.30,
and 18 February 2020, 9.00-12.30 and 14.30-18.30**

BRUSSELS

The meeting opened at 15.11 on Monday, 17 February 2020, with Maria Arena (Chair) presiding.

1. Adoption of agenda

DROI_OJ(2020)0217_1

The agenda was adopted in the form shown in these minutes.

2. Chair's announcements

The Chair announced that the Parliament adopted 2 urgency resolutions during the plenary session of 10-13 February on “Guinea Conakry, notably violence towards protesters” and “Child labour in mines in Madagascar”.

The Chair mentioned the performance of the winner of 2017 Sakharov Prize Lorent Saleh to take place on 18 February at the European Parliament.

The Chair also informed the colleagues who will participate in the DROI delegation to the US-Mexico border that the constituent meeting would be held on 18 February from 17:15 to 18:15.

Finally, the Chair welcomed a new full member to the Subcommittee on Human Rights as a result of Brexit: Mr Christian Sagartz (Austria) from the EPP group.

3. Approval of minutes of meetings

- 2-3 December 2019

PV – PE644.894v01-00

The minutes were approved.

4. Presentation of a study: Biodiversity as a human right and its implications for EU external action

Speakers: Chair, Elisa Morgera (Professor of Global Environmental Law at the University of Strathclyde in Glasgow, Scotland), Isabel Wiseler-Lima, Hannah Neumann.

* * *

The meeting adjourned at 15.49 and resumed at 16.00.

* * *

5. Exchange of views with Yehuda Shaul, co-founder of Breaking the Silence

Speakers: Chair, Yehuda Shaul (co-founder of Breaking the Silence), Peter van Dalen, Hannah Neumann, Evin Incir, Nacho Sánchez Amor, Salima Yenbou, Lars Patrick Berg, Thomas Seiler (Deputy Head of Division, “Israel – occupied Palestinian territory and Middle East peace process”, EEAS).

6. *Public hearing: Respect for minorities, beliefs and religions*

Speakers: Chair, Erin Wilson (Associate Professor and Vice-Dean at the University of Groningen in the Netherlands), Muhammad Nuruddeen Lemu (Director of Research and Training at the Da’Wah Institute in Minna in Nigeria), Marcela Szymanski (Head of the EU office and Advocacy, ‘Aid to the Church in Need’), Peter van Dalen, Nacho Sánchez Amor, György Hölvényi, Salima Yenbou, Raphaël Warolin (Desk Officer, Division for Human Rights, EEAS).

* * *

The meeting adjourned at 18.31 and resumed at 9.12 on 18 February 2020 with Maria Arena (Chair) presiding.

* * *

7. Exchange of views with 2005 Sakharov Prize laureate Bertha Bueno Fuente and

**Elena Larrinaga de Luis on behalf of the Ladies in White ("Damas de Blanco")
and 2010 Sakharov Prize laureate Guillermo Fariñas Hernández**

Speakers: Chair, Elena Larrinaga de Luis (2005 Sakharov Prize laureate on behalf of the Ladies in White - "Damas de Blanco"), Alejandro González Raga (Executive Director of the OCDH - Observatorio Cubano de Derechos Humanos), Heidy Villuendas Ortega (Embassy of Cuba), Francois Roudie (Deputy Head of division, "Mexico, Central America, Caribbean", EEAS).

* * *

The Chair gave the floor to Bernard Guetta for an information point on a project of declaration on the situation in Syria.

* * *

8. Exchange of views on the human rights situation in Turkey (special focus on the situation of academia, lawyers, artists and journalists)

Speakers: Chair, Ishan Cibelik (Member of the Turkish music group Yorum), Sibylle Gioe (lawyer at the Liège bar), Erol Önderoglu (correspondent of the human rights organisation Reporters Without Borders in Turkey and the Editor of Bianet) via webmeeting, Nevzat Uslu (former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine at Sifa University), Sergey Lagodinsky, Nacho Sánchez Amor, Isabel Wiseler-Lima, María Soraya Rodríguez Ramos, Giorgos Georgiou, Loucas Foulas, Peter van Dalen, Philippe Dam (Advocacy Director for Europe and Central Asia, Human Rights Watch), Bernard Brunet (DG NEAR, European Commission), Calin-Ionut Ungur (Deputy Head of Division, "Turkey", EEAS).

In camera

9. Exchange of views on the state of play for a new global human rights sanctions regime

Speakers: Chair, David Geer (Head of Division, Sanctions Policy, EEAS), Cedric Ryngaert (Professor of public international law and programme leader of the master public international law at the School of Law of the University of Utrecht), Silvia Lavagnoli (Human Rights Officer, Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, Regional Office for Europe), Tinatin Tsertsvadze (Advocacy Director, International Partnership for Human Rights), Isabel Santos, Heidi Hautala, Nacho Sánchez Amor.

* * *

The meeting adjourned at 12.48 and resumed at 14.43.

* * *

10. *Public hearing: Authoritarianism and shrinking space for freedom of expression, press freedom and human rights defenders, with case studies on China, Egypt and Russia*

Speakers: Chair, Clément Nyaletsossi Voule (United Nations Special Rapporteur on Rights to Freedom of Peaceful Assembly and of Association), Jianli Yang (Founder and President, Initiatives for China/Citizen Power) via webmeeting, Sarah Brooks (Brussels Liaison officer and Human Rights Advocate at the International Service for Human Rights - ISHR), Jussi Lassila (Senior Research Fellow, Finnish Institute for international Affairs) via webmeeting, Galina Arapova (Director and senior media lawyer of the NGO Mass Media Defence Centre), Speaker, Isabel Santos, Isabel Wiseler-Lima, Heidi Hautala, Ryszard Czarnecki, Salima Yenbou.

In camera

11. Constitutive meeting for the DROI mission to the US-Mexican Border, El Paso, Texas, and Washington DC, United States of America

Speakers: Chair, Maja Urbanska (Deputy Head of Division, “Americas”, EEAS), Maroula Sfondyla (Desk assistant, “Americas”, EEAS), Isabel Wiseler-Lima, Tineke Strik.

* * *

12. Any other business

13. Next meetings

- 18 March 2020, 9.00 – 12.30 and 14.30 – 18.30 (Brussels)
- 19 March 2020, 9.00 – 12.30 (Brussels)

* * *

The meeting closed at 17.50.

* * *

**ПРИСЪСТВЕН ЛИСТ/LISTA DE ASISTENCIA/PREZENČNÍ LISTINA/DELTAGERLISTE/
ANWESENHEITSLISTE/KOHALOLIJATE NIMEKIRI/KATAΣΤΑΣΗ ΠΑΡΟΝΤΩΝ/RECORD OF ATTENDANCE/
LISTE DE PRÉSENCE/POPIS NAZOČNIH/ELENCO DI PRESENZA/APMEKLĒJUMU REĢISTRŠ/DALYVIŲ SAŲAŠAS/
JELENLĒTI ĪV/REĢISTRU TA' ATTENDENZA/PRESENTIELIJST/LISTA OBECNOŠCI/LISTA DE PRESENÇAS/
LISTĂ DE PREZENȚĂ/PREZENČNÁ LISTINA/SEZNAM NAVZOČIH/LÄSNÄOLOLISTA/NÄRVAROLISTA**

Бюро/Mesa/Předsednictvo/Formandskabet/Vorstand/Juhatu/Προεδρείο/Bureau/Predsjedništvo/Ufficio di presidenza/Prezidijs/ Biuras/Elnökség/Prezidium/Birou/Předsednictvo/Predsedstvo/Puheenjohtajisto/Presidiet (*)
Maria Arena (P) (1,2), Hannah Neumann (2nd VP) (1,2).
Членове/Diputados/Poslanci/Medlemmer/Mitglieder/Parlamendiliikmed/Βουλευτές/Members/Députés/Zastupnici/Deputati/Deputāti/ Nariai/Képviselők/Membri/Leden/Posłowie/Deputados/Deputați/Jäsenet/Ledamöter
Lars Patrick Berg (1), Ryszard Czarnecki (2), Filip De Man (1,2), Bernard Guetta (1,2), Heidi Hautala (2), György Hölvényi (1), Karol Karski (2), Dietmar Köster (2), Leopoldo López Gil (1,2), Thierry Mariani (2), Isabel Santos (2), Nacho Sánchez Amor (1,2), Isabel Wiseler-Lima (1,2), Peter van Dalen (1,2).
Заместници/Suplentes/Náhradníci/Stedfortrædere/Stellvertreter/Asendusliikmed/Αναπληρωτές/Substitutes/Suppléants/Zamjenici/ Supplenti/Aizstājēji/Pavaduojantysnariai/Pötagok/Sostituti/Plaatsvervangers/Zastępcy/Membros suplentes/Supleanți/Náhradníci/ Namestniki/Varajäsenet/Suppleanter
Susanna Ceccardi (1), Stelios Kypourouopoulos (1,2), Jaak Madison (2), Gheorghe-Vlad Nistor (2), María Soraya Rodríguez Ramos (2), Tineke Strik (2), Bettina Vollath (2), Salima Yenbou (1,2), Ivan Štefanec (2)

209 (7)
216 (3)
Reinhard Bütikofer (2) (item 8), Engin Eroglu (2) (item 8), Loucas Fourlas (2) (item 8), Giorgos Georgiou (2) (item 8), Evin Incir (1) (item 5), Sergey Lagodinsky (2) (item 8), Annalisa Tardino (2) (item 10)
56 (8) (Точка от дневния ред/Punto del orden del día/Bod pořadu jednání (OJ)/Punkt på dagsordenen/Tagesordnungspunkt/ Päevakorra punkt/Σημείο της ημερήσιας διάταξης/Agenda item/Point OJ/Τοčka dnevnog reda/Punto all'ordine del giorno/Darba kārtības punkts/Darbotvarkēs punktas/Napirendi pont/Punt Agenda/Agendapunt/Punkt porządku dziennego/Ponto OD/Punct de pe ordinea de zi/Bod programu schôdze/Τοčka UL/Esityslistan kohta/Punkt på föredragningslistan)

Присъствал на/Presente el/Přítomný dne/Til stede den/Anwesend am/Viibis(id) kohal/Παρόν στις/Present on/Présent le/Nazočni
dana/Presente il/Piedalījās/ Dalyvauja/Jelen volt/Prezenti fi/Aanwezig op/Obecny dnia/Presente em/Prezent/Prítomný dňa/Navzoči
dne/Läsnä/Närvarande den:

- (1) 17.2.2020
(2) 18.2.2020

Наблюдатели/Observadores/Pozorovatelé/Observatorer/Beobachter/Vaatlejad/Παρατηρητές/Observers/Observateurs/Promatrači/Osservatori/Novērotāji/Stebėtojai/Megfigyelők/Osservatori/Waarnemers/Obserwatorzy/Observadores/Observatori/Pozorovatelia/Papozovalci/Tarkkailijat/Obsevatörer

По покана на председателя/Por invitación del presidente/Na pozvání předsedy/Efter indbydelse fra formanden/Auf Einladung des Vorsitzenden/Esimehe kutsel/Με πρόσκληση του Προέδρου/At the invitation of the Chair/Sur l'invitation du président/ Na poziv predsjednika/Su invito del presidente/Pēc priekšsēdētāja uzaicinājuma/Pirmininkui pakvietus/Az elnök meghívására/ Fuq stedina taċ-'Chairman'/Op uitnodiging van de voorzitter/Na zaproszenie Przewodniczącego/A convite do Presidente/La invitația președintelui/ Na pozwanie predsedu/Na povabilo predsednika/Puheenjohtajan kutsusta/På ordförandens inbjudan
Elisa Morgera (Professor of Global Environmental Law at the University of Strathclyde in Glasgow, Scotland) – Item 4
Yehuda Shaul (co-founder of Breaking the Silence) – Item 5
Erin Wilson (Associate Professor and Vice-Dean at the University of Groningen in the Netherlands), Muhammad Nuruddeen Lemu (Director of Research and Training at the Da'Wah Institute in Minna in Nigeria), Marcela Szymanski (Head of the EU office and Advocacy, 'Aid to the Church in Need') – Item 6
Elena Larrinaga de Luis (2005 Sakharov Prize laureate on behalf of the Ladies in White - "Damas de Blanco"), Alejandro González Raga (Executive Director of the OCDH - Observatorio Cubano de Derechos Humanos) – Item 7
Ishan Cibelik (Member of the Turkish music group Yorum), Sibylle Gioe (lawyer at the Liège bar), Erol Önderoglu (correspondent of the human rights organisation Reporters Without Borders in Turkey and the Editor of Bianet), Nevzat Uslu (former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine at Sifa University), Philippe Dam (Advocacy Director for Europe and Central Asia, Human Rights Watch) – Item 8
Cedric Ryngaert (Professor of public international law and programme leader of the master public international law at the School of Law of the University of Utrecht), Silvia Lavagnoli (Human Rights Officer, Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, Regional Office for Europe), Tinatin Tsertsvadze (Advocacy Director, International Partnership for Human Rights) – Item 9
Clément Nyaletsossi Voule (United Nations Special Rapporteur on Rights to Freedom of Peaceful Assembly and of Association), Jianli Yang (Founder and President, Initiatives for China/Citizen Power), Sarah Brooks (Brussels Liaison officer and Human Rights Advocate at the International Service for Human Rights - ISHR), Jussi Lassila (Senior Research Fellow, Finnish Institute for international Affairs), Galina Arapova (Director and senior media lawyer of the NGO Mass Media Defence Centre) – Item 10

Съвет/Consejo/Rada/Rådet/Rat/Nðukogu/Συμβούλιο/Council/Conseil/Vijeće/Consiglio/Padome/Taryba/Tanács/Kunsill/Raad/Conselho/Consiliu/Svet/Neuvosto/Rådet (*)
Комисия/Comisión/Komise/Kommissionen/Kommission/Komisjon/Επιτροπή/Commission/Komisija/Commissione/Bizottság/Kummissjoni/Commissie/Komisja/Comissão/Comisie/Komisja/Komissio/Kommissionen (*)
Item 8: Bernard Brunet (DG NEAR)
Други институции и органи/Otras instituciones y organismos/Ostatní orgány a instituce/Andre institutioner og organer/Andere Organe und Einrichtungen/Muud institutsioonid ja organid/Λοιπά θεσμικά όργανα και οργανισμοί/Other institutions and bodies/Autres institutions et organes/Druge institucije i tijela/Altre istituzioni e altri organi/Citas iestādes un struktūras/Kitos institucijos ir įstaigos/Más intézmények és szervek/Istituzzjonijiet u korpi ohra/Andere instellingen en organen/Inne instytucje i organy/Outras instituições e outros órgãos/Alte instituții și organe/Iné inštitúcie a orgány/Muut toimielimet ja elimet/Andra institutioner och organ

EEAS	Item 5: Thomas Seiler (Deputy Head of Division, “Israel – occupied Palestinian territory and Middle East peace process”) Item 6: Raphaël Warolin (Desk Officer, Division for Human Rights) Item 7: Francois Roudie (Deputy Head of division, “Mexico, Central America, Caribbean”) Item 8: Calin-Ionut Ungur (Deputy Head of Division, “Turkey”) Item 9: David Geer (Head of Division, Sanctions Policy) Item 11: Maja Urbanska (Deputy Head of Division, “Americas”, EEAS), Maroula Sfondyla (Desk assistant, “Americas”)
------	--

Други учасници/Otros participantes/Ostatní účastníci/Endvidere deltog/Andere Teilnehmer/Muud osalejad/Επίσης παρόντες/Other participants/Autres participants/Drugi sudionici/Altri partecipanti/Citi klātesošie/Kiti dalyviai/Más résztvevők/Partecipanti ohra/Andere aanwezigen/Inni uczestnicy/Outros participantes/Alți participanți/Iní účastníci/Drugi udeleženci/Muut osallistujat/Övriga deltagare	
Heidy Villuendas Ortega (Embassy of Cuba)	

Секретариат на политическите групи/Secretaría de los Grupos políticos/Sekretariát politických skupin/Gruppernes sekretariat/Sekretariat der Fraktionen/Fraktioonide sekretariaat/Γραμματεία των Πολιτικών Ομάδων/Secretariats of political groups/Secrétariat des groupes politiques/Tajništva klubova zastupnika/Segreteria gruppi politici/Politisko grupu sekretariāts/Frakciju sekretoriai/Képviseletcsoportok titkársága/Sekretariat gruppi politici/Fractiesecretariaten/Sekretariat Grup Politycznych/Secretariado dos grupos políticos/Secretariate grupuri politice/Sekretariát politických skupin/Sekretariat političnih skupin/Poliittisten ryhmien sihteeristöt/De politiska gruppernas sekretariat	
PPE	Virostkova
S&D	Bataille, Siil
Renew	Munoa Salaverria
ID	Mazzotti, Roos
Verts/ALE	Fisera
ECR	Hesse
GUE/NGL	Rodriguez Forrest, Vicente Moreno
NI	

Кабинет на председателя/Gabinete del Presidente/Kancelář předsedy/Formandens Kabinet/Kabinett des Präsidenten/Presidendi kantslei/Γραφείο του Προέδρου/President's Office/Cabinet du Président/Ured predsednika/Gabinetto del Presidente/Priekšsēdētāja kabinets/Pirmininko kabinetas/Elnöki hivatal/Kabinett tal-President/Kabinet van de Voorzitter/Gabinet Przewodniczącego/Gabinete do Presidente/Cabinet Președinte/Kancelária predsedu/Urad predsednika/Puhemiehen kabinetti/Talmanens kansli	
Кабинет на генералния секретар/Gabinete del Secretario General/Kancelář generálního tajemníka/Generalsekretærens Kabinet/Kabinett des Generalsekretärs/Peasekretäri büroo/Γραφείο του Γενικού Γραμματέα/Secretary-General's Office/Cabinet du Secrétaire général/Ured glavnog tajnika/Gabinetto del Segretario generale/Generalsekretära kabinets/Generalinio sekretoriaus kabinetas/Főtitkári hivatal/Kabinett tas-Segretarju Generali/Kabinet van de secretaris-generaal/Gabinet Sekretarja Generalnego/Gabinete do Secretário-Geral/Cabinet Secretar General/Kancelária generálneho tajomníka/Urad generalnega sekretarja/Pääsihteerin kabinetti/Generalsekreterarens kansli	

Генерална дирекция/Dirección General/Generální ředitelství/Generaldirektorat/Generaldirektion/Peadirektoraat/Γενική Διεύθυνση/ Directorate-General/Direction générale/Glavna uprava/Direzione generale/Generāldirektorāts/Generalinis direktoratas/Főigazgatóság/ Direttorat Generali/Direktoraten-generaal/Dyrekcja Generalna/Direcção-Geral/Direcții Generale/Generálne riaditeľstvo/Generalni direktorat/Pääosasto/Generaldirektorat	
DG PRES	Lerch, Rakstelyte, Voget Almqvist
DG IPOL	
DG EXPO	
DG EPRS	
DG COMM	
DG PERS	
DG INLO	
DG TRAD	
DG LINC	
DG FINS	
DG ITEC	
DG SAFE	

Правна служба/Servicio Jurídico/Právní služba/Juridisk Tjeneste/Juristischer Dienst/Öigusteenistus/Νομική Υπηρεσία/Legal Service/ Service juridique/Pravna služba/Servizio giuridico/Juridiskais dienests/Teisės tarnyba/Jogi szolgálat/Servizz legali/Juridische Dienst/ Wydział prawny/Serviço Jurídico/Serviciu Juridic/Právny servis/Oikeudellinen yksikkö/Rättstjänsten
Секретариат на комисията/Secretaría de la comisión/Sekretariát výboru/Udvalgssekretariatet/Ausschusssekretariat/Komisjoni sekretariaat/Γραμματεία της επιτροπής/Committee secretariat/Secrétariat de la commission/Tajništvo odbora/Segreteria della commissione/Komitejas sekretariāts/Komiteto sekretoriatas/A bizottság titkársága/Sekretarjat tal-kumitat/Commissiesecretariaat/ Sekretariat komisji/Sekretariado da comissão/Sekretariat comisie/Sekretariat odbora/Valiokunnan sihteeristö/Utskottssekretariatet
Rieu, Chikhi, Csaazi, Franceschinis, Maisonnay, Walelign
Сътрудник/Asistente/Asistent/Assistent/Assistenz/Βοηθός/Assistant/Assistente/Pālīgs/Padējējas/Asszisztens/Asystent/Pomočnik/ Avustaja/Assisterter
Gössling-Wilcke

- * (P) = Председател/Presidente/Předseda/Formand/Vorsitzender/Esimees/Πρόεδρος/Chair/Président/Predsjednik/Priekšsēdētājs/
Pirmininkas/Elnök/Chairman/Voorzitter/Przewodniczący/Preşedinte/Predseda/Predsednik/Puheenjohtaja/Ordförande
- (VP) = Заместник-председател/Vicepresidente/Místopředseda/Næstformand/Stellvertretender Vorsitzender/Aseesimees/Αντιπρόεδρος/
Vice-Chair/Potpredsjednik/Vice-Président/Potpredsjednik/Priekšsēdētāja vietnieks/Pirmininko pavaduotojas/Alelnök/ Viči
'Chairman'/Ondervoorzitter/Wiceprzewodniczący/Vice-Presidente/Vicepreşedinte/Podpredseda/Podpredsednik/
Varapuheenjohtaja/Vice ordförande
- (M) = Член/Miembro/Člen/Medlem./Mitglied/Parlamendiliige/Βουλευτής/Member/Membre/Član/Membro/Deputāts/Narys/Képviselő/
Membbru/Lid/Członek/Membro/Membbru/Člen/Poslanec/Jäsen/Ledamot
- (F) = Длъжностно лице/Funcionario/Úředník/Tjenestemand/Beamter/Ametnik/Υπάλληλος/Official/Fonctionnaire/Dužnosnik/
Funzionario/Ierēdnis/Pareigūnas/Tisztviselő/Ufficial/Ambtenaar/Urządник/Funcionário/Funcionar/Úradník/Uradnik/Virkamies/
Tjänsteman